

Selected Writings of James Madison Pendleton Volume 2 of 3

Compiled and Edited by Thomas White

SELECTED WRITINGS OF JAMES MADISON PENDLETON

VOLUME II

Ecclesiological



JAMES MADISON PENDLETON (1811-1891)

SELECTED WRITINGS OF JAMES MADISON PENDLETON

IN THREE VOLUMES



Ecclesiological

Selected Writings on Various Aspects of the New Testament $C\bar{h}urch$



COMPILED AND EDITED BY THOMAS WHITE



Printed in 2006

by

THE BAPTIST STANDARD BEARER, INC.

No. 1 Iron Oaks Drive Paris, Arkansas 72855 (479) 963-3831



THE WALDENSIAN EMBLEM lux lucet in tenebris "The Light Shineth in the Darkness"

ISBN# 1579780474

SELECTED WRITINGS OF JAMES MADISON PENDLETON IN THREE VOLUMES

VOLUME ONE — HISTORICAL AND AUTOBIOGRAPHICAL

- James Madison Pendleton's Life and His Contribution to Baptist Ecclesiology
 by THOMAS WHITE
- Reminiscences of a Long Life by JAMES MADISON PENDLETON
- Article on the Death of J. M. Pendleton by M. M. RILEY

VOLUME TWO — ECCLESIASTICAL

• Selected Writings on Various Aspects of the New Testament Church

by JAMES MADISON PENDLETON

VOLUME THREE — THEOLOGICAL

• Selected Writings on Various Topics of Theology by James Madison Pendleton

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME II Ecclesiological



	PAGE
Acknowledgements	xi
Introduction	xiii
Church Manual: Designed for the Use of Baptist Churches	5
Distinctive Principles of Baptists	121
An Old Landmark Reset	271
Thoughts on the Lord's Supper	323
Review of John L. Dagg's Manual of Church Order	351
Review of Wayland's Notes on the <i>Principles and Practices of Baptist Churches</i>	377
Miscellaneous Articles:	
Letter on the Extent of Landmarkism: Disagreement with Graves	407
There Is No Danger: Will Landmarkism Split the Convention?	411
The Validity of Baptism Administered by an Unbaptized Evangelist	413
Infant Baptism	417
Why Was Christ Baptized?	419
Sovereignty of Churches	423
Questions Concerning the Call to the Ministry . $$	425
Constitution of Churches: On the Plurality of Elders	427



Acknowledgements

must extend a thank you to those who made this process possible. First, I would like to thank Bill Lee and his Tassociates at the Baptist Standard Bearer who agreed to publish this project. His work to preserve our Baptist heritage will positively impact generations to come. I must also thank the Southern Baptist Historical Library and Archives in Nashville, Tennessee which houses many of these rare resources on microfilm. Also I want to thank Jennifer Faulk for her dedicated service and selfless help in retyping many of these articles. Many teachers and friends have encouraged and guided my study of James Madison Pendleton, including Dr. John Hammett, Dr. Keith Harper, Dr. Paige Patterson, and Dr. James Hilton. Without them, I would not be the person I am today, and this project would never have reached completion. Last, I would like to thank my family tolerated hours of endless work on projects just like this one. Besides my Lord Jesus Christ, Joy is the love of my life, and our daughter Rachel is, of course, the apple of her daddy's eye. God has truly blessed me far beyond anything I could have ever imagined. To Him be praise forever and forever. Amen.



Introduction

his volume is the second volume in a three volume series containing selected works of James Madison Pendleton. As this volume may be purchased separately from the other volumes, an introduction to the life of Pendleton is necessary. For a complete discussion of Pendleton's life and contributions to Baptist ecclesiology, see volume one in this series. For his writings which discuss theological issues other than ecclesiology, see volume three in the series. The current volume focuses on selected ecclesiological writings of James Madison Pendleton.

BRIEF BIOGRAPHY OF J. M. PENDLETON

James Madison Pendleton was born on November 20, 1811, to John and Frances Pendleton at "Twyman's Store" in Spotsylvania County, Virginia, during the presidency of the person after whom he was named—James Madison. In the autumn of 1812, Pendleton's family moved to Christian County, Kentucky. Here Pendleton was reared by "pious Baptist" parents where he attended "the neighborhood schools, at such times as he could be spared from labor."

¹ James Madison Pendleton, *Reminiscences of a Long Life* (Louisville: Baptist Book Concern, 1891), 8. The article in *Baptist Theologians* incorrectly identifies Nov. 11, 1811, as the date of James Madison Pendleton's birth. For a complete biography see William Huddleston, "James Madison Pendleton: A Critical Biography" (ThM thesis, Southern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1962). For a more thorough discussion of Pendleton's influence, see Thomas White, "James Madison Pendleton and His Contributions to Baptist Ecclesiology" (PhD diss. Southeastern Baptist Theological Seminary, 2005).

² J. H. Spencer, *A History of Kentucky Baptists* (Cincinnati: J. H. Spencer, 1885), 523.

During his teenage years, Pendleton demonstrated an acute interest in spiritual matters. Just before turning fifteen, Pendleton used money earned from selling wool to buy his first purchase—a Bible. Pendleton said, "I prized it highly and found great use for it." After turning fifteen, he decided to give great attention to religion, resolving to read his Bible and pray every day. After an extended time of reading his Bible, contemplating his own sinfulness, and attempting to save himself, Pendleton read a sermon by Samuel Davies from 1 Cor 1:22–24. After reading this sermon, he went into the woods to pray and understood for the first time the mercy of salvation through Jesus Christ.⁴

At age seventeen, on the second Sunday in April, 1829, Pendleton went before Bethel Church in Christian County, Kentucky, and told of his conversion experience which had occurred a few weeks earlier in those nearby woods. He was baptized by John S. Wilson the following Tuesday, April 14, in a creek not far from the meeting house.⁵

Pendleton's formal education was limited. Because his father, in addition to being a farmer, taught school, Pendleton learned much at home but did not begin attending the neighborhood school until the age of nine or ten. Although work on the farm often interrupted his studies, Pendleton learned well, and in 1831 at age nineteen, he tried his hand at teaching in the western part of Christian County.⁸ This lasted for only three months, and he returned home discouraged and with only three dollars in his pocket.⁹ By the end of the year, Pendleton moved to Russellville, Kentucky, to study Latin grammar under Robert T.

³ Pendleton, Reminiscences of a Long Life, 22.

⁴ Ben Bogard, *Pillars of Orthodoxy, or Defenders of the Faith* (Louisville: Baptist Book Concern, 1900), 256.

⁵ Pendleton, Reminiscences of a Long Life, 27–8.

⁸ Ibid., 15; 34.

⁹ Bob Compton, "J.M. Pendleton: A Nineteenth-Century Baptist Statesman (1811–1891)," *Baptist History and Heritage* 10 (January 1975): 30.

Anderson.¹⁰ Early in 1833, Pendleton accepted an invitation to minister in Hopkinsville, where he would remain until 1836. This afforded him the opportunity to study at the Academy under the charge of James D. Rumsey, "who had a fine reputation as a classical scholar."¹¹ Pendleton would focus his study on Latin and Greek. After moving in 1836, no further record of formal education exists. However in 1865, Denison University in Ohio conferred upon Pendleton the honorary title of Doctor of Divinity.¹²

Pendleton did not begin as the polished pulpiteer which was to characterize his career. He began by leading prayer meetings during which he largely read Scripture. He did not consider these engagements preaching, but in February of 1830, to Pendleton's astonishment, his home church licensed him to preach. He commented, "I thought it guite uncalled for and did not believe it possible for me to preach." It was the fourth Sunday in September, 1831, when Pendleton preached what he considered his first sermon at a church called West Union about ten miles west of Hopkinsville. Pendleton commented on his effort, "To call what I said a 'sermon' would be flagrant injustice to that term." He felt himself utterly incompetent to preach. His exhortations were very short, consisting of only a few sentences, and when he had said all he could think of to say, he "sought relief from embarrassment in prayer."13 Some agreed with Pendleton's assessment of his preaching. One local pastor stated, "You say some pretty good things, but your preaching is neither adapted to comfort the saint nor alarm the

¹⁰ Pendleton, *Reminiscences of a Long Life*, 37. Anderson founded a school there in 1830. It was said of him, "In this profession he was preeminent, and was of incalculable benefit to the Baptists of Bethel Association, as well as others." See Spencer, *A History of Kentucky Baptists*, 381.

¹¹ Pendleton, *Reminiscences of a Long Life*, 40. No further information can be found about this academy.

¹² J. J. Burnett, Sketches of Tennessee's Pioneer Baptist Preachers (Nashville: Marwill & Bruce, 1919), 406.

¹³ Pendleton, Reminiscences of a Long Life, 31–35.

sinner."¹⁴ However, Pendleton did not give up but continued to improve.

In 1833 while studying in Hopkinsville, Pendleton simultaneously served at two churches, Bethel Church and Hopkinsville, who each gave him a hundred dollars a year. He commented, "Some may think that this was poor pay; but my deliberate opinion is that the pay was better than the preaching." The arrangement with these churches was that he would preach one Saturday and two Sundays in the month to each of the Hopkinsville and Bethel churches. Before long, Pendleton's church at Hopkinsville, of which he had become a member, called for his ordination. The ordination council consisted of four men and met on November 2, 1833. 15

In the latter part of 1836, Pendleton was called to pastor the First Baptist Church of Bowling Green, Kentucky. He officially began January 1, 1837, and continued serving this church for twenty consecutive years with the exception of a few months, spent in Russellville, Kentucky, around 1850. 16 He was the first man in southern Kentucky to devote himself to full-time ministry, making four hundred dollars a year. In August of 1837, Pendleton went with John Waller to the Russell Creek Associational meeting at Columbia in Adair County, Kentucky, on a trip that would change his life forever.

The trip to the Russell Creek Association would cover over seventy miles on horseback. The two gentlemen stayed the night in Glasgow, which was almost half way, with Richard Garnett, and Pendleton was introduced to his daughter,

¹⁴ Bogard, Pillars of Orthodoxy, or Defenders of the Faith, 258.

¹⁵ Pendleton, Reminiscences of a Long Life, 40–42.

¹⁶ Spencer, *History of Kentucky Baptists*, 524. In January 1850, Pendleton kept a commitment to Alfred Taylor by helping him with his church at Green River. The church at Bowling Green, having been without a pastor, invited Pendleton to resume his former place of service. Pendleton accepted and moved back to Bowling Green. See Compton, "J. M. Pendleton: A Nineteenth-Century Baptist Statesman (1811–1891)," 30.

Catherine S. Garnett. Catherine, her brother, and another gentleman accompanied Pendleton to the associational meeting. After the meeting concluded, Pendleton had a thirty-mile ride back to Glasgow during which he became acquainted with Catherine. He wrote, "I was impressed with excellences of her character and her intelligence."17 In October 1837, Pendleton went to Louisville for the formation of the General Association of Kentucky Baptists. On his way home, he went about twenty miles out of the way to visit Catherine. On this visit, he informed her of his love for her and proposed to marry her. This took her by surprise. Thus, Pendleton urged her not to answer immediately. Before the end of the year, Catherine returned with a favorable answer to Pendleton's proposal, and on March 13, 1838, James Madison Pendleton and Catherine S. Garnett were united in holy matrimony. Beginning a family would not take long as the Pendletons gave birth to their first child on January 8, 1839. Their family would eventually include five children. 18

In February 1852, Pendleton invited J. R. Graves to preach at Bowling Green. Pendleton commented to Graves, "I have never given the matter of alien immersion a thorough study and I will be glad to hear you preach on that subject." ¹⁹ By the end of the meeting, Graves's preaching had convinced Pendleton to the point that he announced full agreement with him. Graves had excited the Pedobaptists on the issue of baptism so that several sermons continued to be preached upon the subject after his departure. ²⁰ In fact, the attacks

¹⁷ Pendleton, Reminiscences of a Long Life, 52.

¹⁸ Ibid., 66. John Malcom, his first son, was baptized in 1859. He and his father were on separate sides of the slavery issue, and young John joined the Confederate army. On October 8, 1862, he was killed by the fragment of a shell which struck his forehead. J. M. Pendleton claims that in not one of their letters was a harsh word uttered.

¹⁹ O. L. Hailey, *J. R. Graves Life, Times and Teachings* (Nashville: O. L. Hailey, 1929), 73.

²⁰ Pendleton, Reminiscences of a Long Life, 103.

against Graves by Pedobaptists encouraged Pendleton to defend him more vehemently. Shortly after the revival, Pendleton preached at Liberty Church in Logan County and gave his reasons for being a Baptist. These reasons were later expanded into Pendleton's first book and published under the title, Three Reasons Why I Am a Baptist. The relationship between Pendleton and Graves continued as Pendleton became a regular contributor to the Tennessee Baptist which Graves edited. Pendleton wrote four articles in particular that addressed the issue "Ought Baptists to Recognize Pedobaptist Preachers as Gospel Ministers?" Pendleton answered negatively and his articles were later published in a booklet which Graves titled, "An Old Landmark Re-set." An Old Landmark Re-set."

On January 1, 1857, Pendleton left Bowling Green for Union University where the trustees appointed him head of the Theology department. The trustees said, "They wanted a man who had learned his theology from the Bible." As one of the conditions of his coming to Union, he also became pastor of the Baptist church in Murfreesboro. Pendleton taught between forty and fifty ministerial students. After the

²¹ J. M. Pendleton, "Letter to Brother Graves," *Tennessee Baptist* (June 5, 1852). Says, "And here is to say once for all, that when a minister visits this place at my solicitation, as you did, and conducts a meeting on principles which meet my hearty approbation, as you did, if after his departure, he is calumniated and persecuted, as you have been, I will defend him, though I hear a thousand thunders rolling through the Pedobaptist heavens."

²² Pendleton, *Reminiscences of a Long Life*, 103. The rights to this book were sold to Graves and first published in 1853. In 1856, Pendleton added an addition preface, made some corrections, and included an appendix on the fourth reason for being a Baptist-communion. After the copyright ran out, Pendleton revised and expanded the book. In 1882 it was published by the American Baptist Publishing Society under the title *Distinctive Principles of Baptists*. See Keith Eitel, "James Madison Pendleton," *Baptist Theologians*. Edited by Timothy George (Nashville: Broadman Press, 1990), 188–204.

²³ Pendleton, Reminiscences of a Long Life, 108.

death of the President of Union University, Dr. Joseph H. Eaton, he acted as Chairman of the faculty.

In 1858, Pendleton joined A. C. Dayton and J. R. Graves as joint editors of the Tennessee Baptist. Pendleton also served as editor of the Southern Baptist Review and Eclectic for the six years of its existence—1855 through 1860. With the Civil War approaching, slavery became an increasingly volatile issue. Pendleton's views on slavery had been clearly published in *The Examiner*, some of which were republished in a Nashville paper. He wrote more than twenty articles for Examiner under the name Emancipationist."24 Pendleton clearly distinguished himself as emancipationist and not an abolitionist. Emancipationists believed that slavery should be gradually eliminated while abolitionists sought to do away with slavery immediately. However, some still sought Pendleton's dismissal. The trustees did not wish for Pendleton to offer his resignation, so he continued to teach until the institution suspended service in April 1861.

Graves spent hours trying to convince Pendleton, the only Southern born member of the Landmark triumvirate, to support the Confederacy. Pendleton would not be convinced. He despised the flag which symbolized the Confederacy saying, "I was unwilling to look at it, because it was usurping the place of the flag of the United States—the flag of my heart's love. The 'stars and bars' were utterly distasteful to me."²⁵

Because of the war, the Pendleton family went north in 1862. After arriving in Hamilton, Ohio, Pendleton preached several times and accepted the call to serve as pastor of the church there. While serving there, his mother passed away. He ministered in Hamilton until October 1865, when he received

²⁴ Ibid., 93.

²⁵ Ibid., 122. Pendleton inherited a female slave when his mother died in 1863. The law did not allow him to free her so he hired her out and paid her the money she earned plus ten percent. He says, "I was not a slave-holder *morally*, but *legally*." See pages 127–28.

the call to serve at Upland Baptist Church in Upland, Pennsylvania.

While at Upland, he served as trustee of Crozer Theological Seminary, added thirty feet to the meeting house, built a new baptistry, and planted two churches. Twenty-five husbands and wives made professions of faith, and Pendleton eagerly baptized them. During this time, Pendleton published what he considered to be his "best and most important book" titled Christian Doctrines. This decidedly biblical theology was written specifically for the benefit of "colored ministers" in the South but was acceptable to other readers as well.²⁶

In June 1883, Pendleton resigned from Upland Baptist Church at the age of seventy-two under the belief that judicious ministers should not pastor after reaching the age of seventy. The Pendletons spent their remaining time visiting their children, and he continued to write. It was fitting that Pendleton ended his life where he devoted so much of it—Bowling Green, Kentucky. He died on March 5, 1891, at 12:40 P.M.²⁷ Those speaking at his funeral included such notable figures as Dr. T. T. Eaton and William H. Whittsitt.²⁸ Pendleton was buried in Fairview cemetery about one mile outside of Bowling Green. Mrs. Pendleton was buried in the same location on September 21, 1898.²⁹

SUMMARY OF WORKS IN THIS VOLUME

In volume two, most of the works focus on various aspects of ecclesiology. This volume contains the following: Church Manual: Designed for the Use of Baptist Churches; Distinctive

²⁶ Ibid., 152.

²⁷ Unsigned article, "Editorial Notes of Death of J. M. Pendleton," Western Recorder (March 12, 1891).

²⁸ Ibid., 198. Interestingly, Whitsitt was involved in a controversy while President at Southern Baptist Theological Seminary over the origin of Baptists in which Landmarkers were his chief opponents.

²⁹ Huddleston, "James Madison Pendleton," 92. The information was apparently given through a letter written by Mr. Claude L. Thomas, Superintendent of the Fairview Cemetery, in a letter dated March 9, 1962.

Principles of the Baptists; "An Old Landmark Reset;" "Thoughts on the Lord's Supper;" "Review of John Dagg's Manual of Church Order," "Review of Wayland's Notes on the Principles and Practices of Baptists," and Miscellaneous which include: "Letter on the Extent Landmarkism: Disagreement with Graves:" "There Is No 'Will Landmarkism Split the Convention?;" "Questions Concerning the Call to the Ministry;" "The Validity of Baptism Administered by an Unbaptized Evangelist;" "Infant Baptism;" "Why Was Christ Baptized?;" "Sovereignty of Churches;" and "Constitution of Churches: On the Plurality of Elders." A brief summary of information about the major works will follow.

Pendleton's *Church Manual: Designed for the Use of Baptist Churches* was published in 1867 and devotes 162 pages to the theological discussion before providing a very practical set of appendices amounting to nineteen pages. Pendleton begins this discussion by acknowledging the existence of the universal church, calling it the redeemed in the aggregate. He acknowledges that this is the intended meaning of several passages in Ephesians. This acknowledgment is not a typical Landmark belief.³⁰

Of particular emphasis is Pendleton's definition of a church. He writes.

A church is a congregation of Christ's baptized disciples, acknowledging him as their Head, relying on his atoning sacrifice for justification before God, and depending on the Holy Spirit for sanctification, united in the belief of the gospel, agreeing to maintain its ordinances and obey its precepts, meeting together for worship, and cooperating for the extension of Christ's kingdom in the world.³¹

After giving a definition of a church, he states two categories

³⁰ James Madison Pendleton, *Baptist Church Manual* (Nashville: Broadman & Holman, 1966), 5.

³¹ Pendleton, Baptist Church Manual, 7.

of prerequisites for joining a church, "moral" and "ceremonial." Under moral requirements, Pendleton addresses repentance, faith, and regeneration. Under the ceremonial requirements, Pendleton discusses only one—baptism.

The remainder of the book discusses the officers of a church, the doctrine of a church, the ordinances of a church, the government of a church, the discipline of a church, and the duties of a church. The final appendices of this book provide a very practical guide to managing the normal business of a church. He begins with business meetings, giving an abridged version of *Robert's Rules of Order*. The next section includes examples of minutes and letters. The third section gives a sample marriage ceremony, while the fourth addresses the province of associations and councils stressing the church as the highest authority.

Distinctive Principles of Baptists is a revised version of Pendleton's work that began many years earlier. Pendleton was asked to defend his Baptist beliefs during the 1850s. He said, "I was called on to preach a dedication sermon at Liberty Church, Logan County, and I gave my reasons for being a Baptist." He later expanded this sermon into a book called *Three Reasons Why I Am a Baptist.* The preface, written May 4, 1853, said, "Many brethren have expressed a desire that these Reasons should be published, giving it as their opinion, that the publication would promote scriptural views of Baptism and Church Government." The following three were his reasons for being Baptist:

 $^{^{\}rm 32}$ Pendleton, Reminiscences of a Long Life, 103.

³³ James Madison Pendleton, *Three Reasons Why I Am a Baptist* (Cincinnati: Moore, Anderson & Company, 1853). This was his first work designed to be published as a book, and before his death, this book would be published under two additional titles. *Three Reasons Why I Am a Baptist with a Fourth Reason Added on Communion* (St. Louis: National Baptist Publishing, 1856); and *Distinctive Principles of Baptists* (Philadelphia: American Baptist Publication Society, 1882).

³⁴ Pendleton, Three Reasons Why I Am a Baptist, iii.

(1) because Baptists regard the baptism of infants as unscriptural, and insist on the baptism of believers in Christ—and of believers alone; (2) because Baptists consider the immersion in water, of a believer, essential to baptism—so essential that there is no baptism without it; and (3) because Baptists practice the congregational form of church government, which is the New Testament model.³⁵

In 1856, after the book had sold approximately thirteen thousand copies, Pendleton decided to add two appendices and make a few minor changes to *Three Reasons Why I Am a Baptist*. ³⁶ The first appendix was Pendleton's fourth reason for being Baptist, "Baptists alone scripturally observe the Lord's Supper." ³⁷ In this section, Pendleton denied the legitimacy of transubstantiation and consubstantiation. He further stressed that the Lord's Supper was "a Church ordinance, to be observed as a memorial of the death of Christ." ³⁸ As a church ordinance, the Lord's Supper should be observed only by the members of a visible church of Christ. Because Pendleton did not believe that Pedobaptist churches were visible churches of Christ, they could not properly partake in communion and could not commune with Baptist churches.

Twenty-nine years after Pendleton had sold the right to his *Three Reasons* to Graves, he revised and expanded the book, publishing it in 1882 with the American Baptist Publishing Society under the title *Distinctive Principles of Baptists*. Although the content of this work only slightly differs from

³⁵ Ibid., 1, 82, and 148. Pendleton later added a fourth reason which was because Baptists alone scripturally observe the Lord's Supper. See Pendleton, *Three Reasons Why I Am a Baptist with a Fourth Reason Added on Communion*, 172.

³⁶ The first appendix was his fourth reason for being a Baptist which addressed communion, and the second appendix discussed the perpetuity of circumcision as it relates to Jewish people.

 $^{^{\}rm 37}$ Pendleton, Three Reasons I am a Baptist, with a Fourth Reason Added, on Communion, 172.

³⁸ Ibid., 177.

the earlier editions, the tone in dealing with the issues is much milder.³⁹ One notable omission is that the fourth reason on communion avoids discussing intercommunion between Baptist churches. This probably occurred as a result of Pendleton's disagreement over the issue with Graves. Record of this disagreement can be seen in the miscellaneous articles included in this volume.

Two other changes emerge throughout the content and tone of the work. Pendleton appears to have developed greater clarity concerning the issues. Chapter three in the Distinctive Principles of Baptists is titled "Baptist hold that, according to the scriptural order, persons must come first to Christ and then to the church and its ordinances."40 Pendleton more clearly stresses this as the difference between Baptists and other denominations. concurred stating blood before water, Christ before the Church.⁴¹ The second difference is the tone throughout. In this work, one understands that Baptists are clearly different from other denominations and should remain distinct. In the other works, one clearly understands that the Baptists are the only people who correctly follow the New Testament and maintain a proper church.

An Old Landmark Reset came about in interesting fashion and created a firestorm of debates and articles. Two years lapsed between Pendleton's initial rejection of alien immersion and his systematic defense of Landmarkism. This printed defense emerged as four articles in the *Tennessee Baptist* titled "Ought Baptists to Recognize Pedobaptist Preachers as Gospel Ministers?"⁴² This question Pendleton

³⁹ Huddleston, *James Madison Pendleton: A Critical Biography*, 66. Huddleston agrees with this analysis of the situation.

⁴⁰ Pendleton, Distinctive Principles of Baptists, 159.

 $^{^{41}}$ J. R. Graves, $Old\ Landmarksim$ (Texarkana, TX: Bogard Press, nd), 43.

⁴² James Madison Pendleton, "Ought Baptists to Recognize Pedobaptist Preachers as Gospel Ministers?," *Tennessee Baptist* (July 22, 1854); "Ought Baptists to Recognize Pedobaptist Preachers as Gospel Ministers? Number Two," *Tennessee Baptist* (August 5, 1854); "Ought Baptists to Recognize

answered in the negative. The first three articles put forth the position and the fourth article responded to several objections which had been raised. These four articles were accumulated and published in one tract which Graves titled, *An Old Landmark Re-set.* ⁴³ The title of this tract, which referred to a couple of Old Testament texts, provided the name "Landmarkism" for the movement. ⁴⁴ Pendleton's life would never return to normalcy after this publication.

Pendleton originally wrote "Thoughts on the Lord's Supper" in twenty one articles which were published in the *Tennessee Baptist* newspaper. These articles put forth Pendleton's theology of the Lord's Supper including discussions of the meaning, the administration, the symbolism and the participants in the supper. Pendleton includes a discussion of the Passover as part of the foundation for the Lord's Supper and provides many insights into this common practice.

Next one will find Pendleton's "Review of Dagg's Church Order." ⁴⁵ Dagg, who was perhaps the premier Southern Baptist theologian of this time, also did extensive work in the area of ecclesiology. Pendleton seemed pleased that this book had been written as it filled some gaps in Dagg's Manual of Theology. He said, "We are glad that the former volume has been succeeded by the present [A Manual of Church Order],

Pedobaptist Preachers as Gospel Ministers? Number Three," *Tennessee Baptist* (August 12, 1854); and "Ought Baptists to Recognize Pedobaptist Preachers as Gospel Preachers?" *Tennessee Baptist* (December 16, 1854).

⁴³ Pendleton, *Reminiscences of a Long Life*, 103, stated that Graves gave the document its title. Pendleton, *An Old Landmark Re-set*. This work has been re-published from Bogard, *Pillars of Orthodoxy*, or *Defenders of the Faith*, 266–311. References will be from the reprint edition.

⁴⁴ The two passages to which this referred are the King James Version of Prov 22:28, "Remove not the ancient landmark, which your fathers have set;" and Prov 23:10, "Remove not the old landmark; and enter not into the fields of the fatherless." All Scripture unless otherwise noted will be from the New King James Version.

⁴⁵ James Madison Pendleton, "Review of Dagg's *Church Order*," *The Southern Baptist Review* 5 (January 1859): 36–55. John Dagg, *Manual of Church Order* (Charleston: Southern Baptist Publication Society, 1858; reprint, Harrisonburg: Gano Books, 1990), 225.

for there was a vacuum that needed to be filled. True, it is not, in all respects, filled just as we would have it, but this circumstance will not be made the occasion of captious complaint." ⁴⁶ Pendleton did not express anger over a twelve page section specifically criticizing his tract "An Old Landmark Re-set." ⁴⁷

Dagg criticized Pendleton for starting with a premise furnished by a Pedobaptist rather than one furnished from Scripture itself.⁴⁸ He also disagreed with Pendleton concerning ministers, writing "that ministers of the word, as such, are officers of the universal church; and that their call to the ministry by the Holy Spirit, is complete in itself, without the addition of outward ceremony."⁴⁹

Pendleton specifically responded to Dagg's placement of the officers in the realm of the universal church by questioning why local Baptist churches ordained preachers if they are officers of the universal church. Concerning Dagg's comments, Pendleton concluded, "More than four years have passed away since the Landmark was written; but we are not yet inclined to retract a single sentence. . . ."50

Pendleton interacted with Francis Wayland by writing a review of his *Notes on the Principles and Practices of Baptists.*⁵¹ This review provided insight into the cultural factors behind Landmarkism's success and pointed to areas of agreement between Pendleton and Wayland. While Pendleton agreed with the majority of the work, he harbored personal feelings against Wayland for his actions in a controversy with the American Bible Society in 1836 in

⁴⁶ Pendleton, "Review of Dagg's Church Order," 36.

⁴⁷ Dagg, Manual of Church Order, 286–98.

 $^{^{48}}$ Ibid., 289. See pp. 31–32 in this dissertation for further discussion of this premise.

⁴⁹ Ibid., 292.

⁵⁰ Pendleton, "Review of Dagg's Church Order," 46.

⁵¹ James Madison Pendleton, "A Review of *Principles and Practices of Baptists*," *The Southern Baptist Review* 3 (January 1857): 51–73. Francis Wayland, *Notes on the Principles and Practices of Baptist Churches* (New York: Sheldon & Co., 1857).

which Wayland supported the decision of the Society to translate the word "baptizo" as baptize instead of immerse. 52

Pendleton agreed with Wayland on baptism, local church independence, and the call to the ministry. Wayland indicated that the church carried the authority for appointing ministers of the Gospel. This pleased Pendleton as it supported one of his points in *An Old Landmark Re-set*. In an interesting note, both Pendleton and Wayland agreed that restricting music to choirs should not be practiced and longed for a time when Baptist congregations would cease to praise God by proxy and personally sing praises to His name. Pendleton concluded his review by stating, "We, therefore, give it a hearty recommendation, though we may not endorse every sentiment it contains." 53

The most important miscellaneous article in this volume is the letter Pendleton wrote to J.J.D. Renfroe. This letter establishes the disagreement with Graves over the extent of Landmarkism and also establishes that Pendleton considered himself a Landmarker late in his life. The letter specifically addresses the intercommunion among Baptist churches which Graves said was not biblical. Pendleton had no objection to it, and desired to limit Landmarkism to its most basic element—the denial of Pedobaptist ministers as gospel ministers and Pedobaptist churches as true churches.

The other articles can stand by themselves without introduction. They were all written as articles for the *Tennessee Baptist* newspaper. The title clearly enough defines their topic. In areas where the title of the article was merely "questions," this editor has provided additional

⁵² Pendleton stated, "Our prejudice may have originated partly on other accounts. We do not deny that while we have ever admired Dr. Wayland's intellectual greatness, we have for years deplored his want of nerve and decision as a Baptist. How could we do otherwise than regret his preparing the obnoxious resolution adopted by the American Bible Society in 1836—a resolution which virtually makes the common English Version the standard of all translations on which said Society bestows its patronage?" See Pendleton, "A Review of *Principles and Practices of Baptists*," 51–52.

⁵³ Ibid., 72–73.

information in the title to explain the topic of discussion. The articles included are: "Letter on the Extent of Landmarkism: Disagreement with Graves;" "There Is No Danger: 'Will Landmarkism Split the Convention?;" "Questions Concerning the Call to the Ministry;" "The Validity of Baptism Administered by an Unbaptized Evangelist;" "Infant Baptism;" "Why Was Christ Baptized?;" "Sovereignty of Churches;" and "Constitution of Churches: On the Plurality of Elders." Most of these articles are short, but they are valuable pieces of information which can help one understand James Madison Pendleton, Landmarksim, and Baptist life in the 1800s.

CHURCH MANUAL: DESIGNED FOR THE USE OF BAPTIST CHURCHES

CHURCH MANUAL: DESIGNED FOR THE USE OF BAPTIST CHURCHES

JAMES MADISON PENDLETON

PHILADELPHIA, PENNSYLVANIA AMERICAN BAPTIST PUBLICATION SOCIETY, 1867.



Thou hast given a standard to them that fear thee that it may be displayed because of the truth. -- Psalm 60:4

"Good principles are good things, but they have no self-propagating power. Principles are powerless apart from the persons who hold them. Baptists sometimes forget this. They are so confident in the correctness of their principles as to feel that all will be well. They think that their views, without any effort on their part, will commend themselves to general acceptance. They suppose that a good cause may be left to take care of itself; but no cause, however good, takes care of itself. Its friends must advocate it, and by their advocacy secure its triumph. Baptists must not forget that they are 'fellow-helpers to the truth.' None of them should fail to give the 'truth' their help. None should ever act as if they were ashamed of being Baptists. Their principles, when assailed, should never lack defense or vindication from them. Their silence, when they should speak, would be a culpable and an injurious silence. Baptists should be ready not only to meet and to repel attacks made on their principles, but should earnestly engage in the propagation of those principles. Leaving, on suitable occasions, their fortresses of defense, they should invade the domain of error and become actively aggressive. This is one fault of some of the Baptists of this generation—that they do not zealously propagate their distinctive views. They should see to it that the truth as embodied in their distinctive principles is brought into direct, positive, constant, exterminating contact with the error opposed to those principles. What distinctive mission have Baptists, if this is not their mission? —to present the truth in love on the matters wherein they differ from Pedobaptists. What is there but this that justifies their denominational existence and saves them from the reproach of being schismatics? If they have a right to denominational life, it is their duty to propagate their distinctive principles, without which that life cannot be maintained."

JAMES MADISON PENDLETON

Distinctive Principles of Baptists (Philadelphia: American Baptist Publication Society, 1882).

The Baptist Standard Bearer, Incorporated is a republication society organized in 1984, and is recognized as a nonprofit, tax-exempt charitable organization. It was founded for the primary purpose of republication and preservation of materials reflecting the Baptist heritage.

